

# AGENDA

## THE SCOTTSDALE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

**DAY & DATE:** Thursday, November 13, 2003

**TIME:** 5:00 p.m.

**LOCATION:** 1st Floor Community Development Conference Room,  
One Civic Center, 7447 E. Indian School Road, Scottsdale, AZ

1. Welcome to New Commissioners, Introductions and Roll Call
2. Minutes: October 9, 2003 Minutes

### **PUBLIC HEARING/ACTION ITEMS**

3. Public Hearing/Discussion/Possible Action: **Initiation of HP-Historic Property Zoning for Pink Pony Restaurant:** Consider the Historic Preservation Commission initiating an HP overlay zoning case for the Pink Pony Restaurant at 3831 N. Scottsdale Road, owned by Ms. Gwen Briley, to place the property on the Scottsdale Historic Register.
4. Public Hearing/Discussion/Possible Action: **Initiation of HP-Historic Property Zoning for Sugar Bowl Restaurant:** Consider the Historic Preservation Commission initiating an HP overlay zoning case for the Sugar Bowl Restaurant at 4005 N. Scottsdale Road, owned by Huntress Trusts, Ms. Jaclyn Krawczyk, Ms. Margery Morton, and Mr. Frederick Huntress, to place the property on the Scottsdale Historic Register.
5. Public Hearing/Discussion/Possible Action: **Initiation of HP-Historic Property Zoning for the Simonson Building:** Consider the Historic Preservation Commission initiating an HP overlay zoning case for the Simonson Building at 3950 N. Brown Avenue, owned by Sunbrella Properties LTD, to place the property on the Scottsdale Historic Register.

### **REGULAR AGENDA ITEMS**

6. Report/Work Study: **Report on Building Condition Assessment Report and Discussion of Craftsman Court Design Guidelines Section of the HP Plan**
7. Committee Reports/Meeting Schedules/Discussion:
  - Historic Register Committee and Subdivisions – Commissioners Gonzales and Wimmer
  - Education Outreach Committee and Newsletter – Discuss Chair
8. Report/Discussion: HPO/Staff Report and Announcements
  - Response on Studies on Economic Impacts of Historic Preservation
  - Guide to Mitigation Plans – Request for comments
  - Taliesin West, Cattle Track, Hotel Valley Ho and downtown properties Updates
  - Building for Success panel and Other information items
9. Commissioner Comments and Announcements /Public Comments\*
10. Future Meetings and Agenda Items\*
  - Report on Results of Citywide Multifamily Housing Survey in December
11. Adjournment

\*The Commission cannot discuss or vote on items not on the agenda, including items brought up as Commission or public comments. If action by a Commission is needed, the item should be placed on the next meeting's agenda to be consistent with the Arizona Open Meetings Law.



Persons with a disability may request a reasonable accommodation, such as a sign language interpreter, by contacting the City Clerk's Office at 312-2412. Requests should be made as early as possible to allow time to arrange accommodations.

**MINUTES  
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION  
7447 E. Indian School Road  
First Floor Community Development Conference Room  
November 13, 2003  
5:00 P.M.**

**CALL TO ORDER**

The meeting was called to order at 5:00 P.M.

**ATTENDANCE**

Present: Cathy Johnson, Chairperson  
Nancy Dallett  
B.J. Gonzales  
George Hartz  
Kathy Howard  
Ed Wimmer

Absent: Paul Winslow

Staff: Bob Caferella  
Debbie Abele, HPO  
Don Meserve

Visitors: Thomas Krawczyk

**WELCOME TO NEW COMMISSIONERS, INTRODUCTIONS AND ROLL CALL**

A formal roll call confirmed members present as stated above.

Chairperson Johnson introduced Mr. George Hartz as the newly appointed commission member. She reported Paul Winslow, architect, was also appointed to the Commission but was unable to attend because of a prior commitment.

**MINUTES**

Chairperson Johnson stated that the minutes of October 9, 2003 regular meeting stood approved as presented.

**PUBLIC HEARING/ACTION ITEMS: INITIATION OF THREE HP ZONING CASES**

Ms. Abele provided an overview of the initiation process for HP overlay zoning cases. She stated at this point in the process there would not be any presentations or information provided about the merits and eligibility of the properties for designation consideration. This simply starts the process. She further stated a flow chart contained in the Commission packet outlines the steps to zone property HP and place it on the Scottsdale Historic Register. They are at Step 3 of the process.

Ms. Able reported the Commission would need to act on each one of these items separately. She further reported an appropriate motion would be to move to initiate the HP zoning stating the name and address of the property.

**Initiation of HP-Historic Property Zoning for Sugar Bowl Restaurant:** Consider the Historic Preservation Commission initiating an HP overlay zoning case for the Sugar Bowl Restaurant at 4005 N. Scottsdale Road, owned by Huntress Trusts, Ms. Jaclyn Krawczyk, Ms. Margery Morton, and Mr. Frederick Huntress, to place the property on the Scottsdale Historic Register.

Mr. Krawczyk, husband of Mrs. Krawczyk, one of the owners, inquired if the application applied to the entire building or just the Sugar Bowl portion. Ms. Abele replied it would include the entire property known as the Sugar Bowl building, 3935 and 4005 N. Scottsdale Road.

Commissioner Wimmer moved for initiation of HP-Historic Property Zoning for the Sugar Bowl building at 3935 and 4005 N. Scottsdale Road. Seconded by Commissioner Gonzales and passed unanimously.

✓ **Initiation of HP-Historic Property Zoning For Pink Pony Restaurant:** Consider the Historic Preservation Commission initiating an HP overlay zoning case for the Pink Pony Restaurant at 3831 N. Scottsdale Road, owned by Ms. Gwen Briley, to place the property on the Scottsdale Historic Register.

Commissioner Gonzales commented that this was not the original Pink Pony building. Ms. Abele stated the desire is to designate the current building that houses the Pink Pony today.

Commissioner Hartz inquired about the timeline for future steps. Ms. Abele stated they hope to have these cases for public hearing, Step 11, before the Commission by February and go before the Planning Commission in March and before the City Council in May for National Historic Preservation Week.

Commissioner Wimmer inquired if the owners of the building are supportive of this designation. Ms. Abele replied in the affirmative.

Commissioner Gonzales moved for initiation of HP-Historic Property Zoning for Pink Pony Restaurant at 3831 N. Scottsdale Road. Seconded by Commissioner Hartz and passed unanimously.

**Initiation of HP-Historic Property Zoning for the Simonson Building:** Consider the Historic Preservation Commission initiating an HP overlay zoning case for the Simonson Building at 3950 N. Brown Avenue, owned by Sunbrella Properties LTD, to place the property on the Scottsdale Historic Register.

Commissioner Wimmer inquired if they have the support of the property owners for this nomination. Ms. Abele replied in the affirmative.

Commissioner Dallett moved for initiation of HP-Historic Property Zoning for the Simonson Building at 3950 N. Brown Avenue. Seconded by Commissioner Howard and passed unanimously.

## **REGULAR AGENDA ITEMS**

### **REPORT ON BUILDING CONDITION ASSESSMENT REPORT AND DISCUSSION ON THE CRAFTSMAN COURT DESIGN GUIDELINES SECTION OF THE HP PLAN**

Ms. Abele stated an excerpt from Historic Preservation Ordinance Section 6.119 is contained in the Commission packet as a reminder that the designation on the Scottsdale Historic Register is the first step in the work that needs to be accomplished. She remarked staff prepares a designation report (historic significance and integrity assessment report) because they have the responsibility during the public hearing process to put on record those things about the property that they consider important as a reason for designating it a historic property.

She provided a brief overview on the process for preparing the building condition assessment (BCA) report for properties zoned HP. The building assessment report aids the property owner in understanding the current condition to help them in the planning, maintenance, and repair. Ms. Abele reported that not all of the seven buildings in Craftsman Court (now Kiva Center) are of equal historic significance. She further reported the need to look at each building individually.

Ms. Abele stated the complex is composed of multiple buildings arranged around a central courtyard, with views from public rights-of-way into the complex interior. She noted the pedestrian scale created by the one-story height buildings along street frontages. There is a strong relationship of indoor space to the outdoors in the design. She reviewed a list of the character-defining features for buildings 1, 2 & 7, buildings 3, 4, 6, and 6a, and building 5 and 5a.

Commissioner Dallett inquired if the original design of these buildings was responding to anything in the vicinity. Ms. Abele replied in the negative noting that it was an open field at the time the building was designed and constructed.

Commissioner Gonzales provided historical information on this site and individuals involved.

Ms. Abele reviewed the proposed guidelines for rehabilitation, additions, and new construction.

Commissioner Wimmer stated the metal screening for the air conditioning units has always troubled him. Ms. Abele stated that issue is addressed under rehabilitation guideline No. 10.

Commissioner Dallett inquired if the entryway signage would be part of the design guidelines. Ms. Abele stated the sign is very contemporary and was part of the '93 redo. They can certainly encourage them to have appropriate signage.

Mr. Meserve suggested under additions No. 2 they include pedestrian walkways.

Ms. Abele stated they would have another work session at the December meeting and go back through this information.

Chairperson Johnson requested that everyone go to Craftsman Court before the December meeting. Chairperson Johnson reminded the commissioners' when they go out to look at these buildings to not make comments.

## **COMMITTEE REPORTS**

### **Historic Register Committee**

Commissioner Wimmer reported they did have a very constructive committee meeting and went through the entire issue of the criteria for the subdivisions and chose the top candidate neighborhoods. Staff assigned two people to each neighborhood to do a building assessment on those buildings to see if they complied with the guidelines. They want to have that completed after the first of the year. He further reported their next meeting is scheduled for December 3, 2003 at 5:15 pm.

### **Education Outreach Committee**

Chairperson Johnson stated Janet Wilson has been the Chairperson of this committee and since she is no longer on the Commission, they would need to appoint another commission member to serve as Chairperson. She further stated Janet is willing to serve as co-Chair. Chairperson Johnson read the Mission Statement for the Education Outreach Committee and outlined the role and responsibilities to allow someone to determine if they would like to serve on the committee. Commissioner Hartz volunteered to serve and will contact Janet Wilson for more information.

## **HPO/STAFF REPORT AND ANNOUNCEMENTS**

Ms. Abele reported on September 23, 2003, Taliesin West property went to the City Council to receive funding assistance in a development agreement. As part of the terms of receiving funding, Taliesin West has agreed to be designated a historical property (HP) and placed on the Scottsdale Historic Register. She further reported the City has 90 days from September 23, 2003 under the terms of the agreement to form the district boundary and initiate the HP overlay zoning case. She noted the Frank Lloyd Wright Foundation is committed to working with various consultants to do extensive research on the evolution of the Frank Lloyd Wright buildings.

Ms. Able reported on November 5, 2004, the Planning Commission unanimously approved a recommendation to City Council to approve the Cattle Track site plan. Mr. Meserve stated that case, 35-ZN-1995#4, is scheduled to go the City Council for a hearing on January 6, 2004.

Ms. Abele stated the City Council approved the incentive package for the Hotel Valley Ho by a five to one vote on November 4, 2003. This portion of the HP Plan required Council approval.

Mr. Meserve stated information is included in the Commission packets on other States that have completed research on the economic impacts of historic preservation. This information was compiled in response to a Commission request for information on economic impacts.

Mr. Meserve requested commissioners' comments by the end of the year on the draft Guide to Mitigation Plans, describing Scottsdale's archaeology requirements for mitigation. The draft was mailed to Commissioners for comments on October 15, 2003.

Chairperson Johnson stated she attended the Building for Success panel at the Civic Center Library noting it was a wonderful presentation. She further stated that Ms. Abele did a wonderful job with her talk on neighborhoods in the southern part of Scottsdale. She also thanked Mr. Meserve for preparing the powerpoint component of the presentation.

Mr. Meserve inquired if the Commission wanted to participate in the Parada del Sol Parade held on January 31, 2004. Chairperson Johnson stated the commissioners' generally ride on a covered wagon or flatbed and wave to the crowd. She further stated people enjoy having them participate. The Commission agreed to participate in the 2004 Parada del Sol Parade.

Mr. Meserve stated the City is involved in SolFest event in April and they have added an extra event on Friday called KidFest to educate children on the environment and they are looking for volunteers to help assist with the Friday event. He further stated the Environmental Quality Advisory Board (EQAB) is also seeking a resolution of support.

Chairperson Johnson stated they would have the Education Committee look into that.

### **COMMISSIONER COMMENTS / PUBLIC COMMENT**

Commissioner Gonzales commented that he felt they have received very positive response from the Planning Commission and City Council regarding the Hotel Valley Ho and he felt that would put a positive spin on their efforts.

Commissioner Gonzales reported that the parish for Our Lady of Perpetual Help Mission Church has hired an architect and will be performing some renovations of this historic property on Brown Avenue. Ms. Abele stated those renovations are a result of the Building Condition Assessment report prepared by Don Ryden, architect funded by the Historic Preservation Program. She further stated the City has provided fire sprinklers for the Mission Church for fire safety.

### **FUTURE MEETINGS AND AGENDA ITEMS**

Chairperson Johnson stated the Commission needs to look at the calendar and set a date for the annual January retreat. The consensus of the Commission was to hold the retreat on Saturday, January 24, 2004.

Ms. Abele stated that they also need to plan a training session on the roles and responsibilities of the Commission.

Chairperson Johnson reported the next meeting will be held on December 11, 2003.

Meeting adjourned at 6:50 p.m.

Submitted by:

For the Record Court Reporters

111303min

## AMENDED AGENDA

### THE SCOTTSDALE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

**DAY & DATE:** Thursday, February 12, 2004

**TIME:** 5:00 p.m.

**LOCATION:** 1st Floor Community Development Conference Room,  
One Civic Center, 7447 E. Indian School Road, Scottsdale, AZ

1. Introductions and Roll Call
2. Minutes: January 8, 2003 Minutes
3. **Presentation: Overview of Downtown Survey Process and Findings – Debbie Abele, HPO**
4. Presentation: Review of HP Ordinance Designation Criteria – Debbie Abele, HPO

### PUBLIC HEARING/ACTION ITEMS

- ✓ 5. **19-ZN-2003/5-HP-2003, Pink Pony Restaurant Historic Property Overlay Zoning:** request by City of Scottsdale, applicant, Charles W. Briley Revocable Trust (Gwen Briley), owner, to rezone from Central Business District (C-2) to Central Business, Historic Property (C-2 HP) on an .2± acre parcel located at 3831 N. Scottsdale Road. **Staff/Applicant contact person is Don Meserve, 480-312-2523.** Comments: This request would add Historic Property (HP) overlay zoning to the Pink Pony Restaurant property in downtown Scottsdale, and place the building on the Scottsdale Historic Register. No changes in use or the underlying zoning are proposed.
6. **20-ZN-2003/6-HP-2003, Sugar Bowl Historic Property Overlay:** request by City of Scottsdale, applicant, Jaclyn H. Krawczyk, Margery H. Morton, Frederick R. Huntress, and Northern Trust Bank, N.A, Trustee, owners to rezone from Central Business District (C-2) to Central Business, Historic Property (C-2 HP) on .13± acre parcel located at 3935 and 4005 N. Scottsdale Road. **Staff/Applicant contact person is Don Meserve, 480-312-2523.** Comments: This request would add Historic Property (HP) overlay zoning to the Sugar Bowl property containing two businesses (Sugar Bowl and AZ Accents) in downtown Scottsdale, and place the building on the Scottsdale Historic Register. No changes in use or the underlying zoning are proposed.
7. **Initiation of HP-Historic Property Zoning for the Weirich –Westernaire Shops:** Consider the Historic Preservation Commission initiating an HP overlay zoning case for the Westernaire Shops at 7239 E. 1<sup>st</sup> Avenue, owned by Mabel Weirich, to place the property on the Scottsdale Historic Register. (Note: Eastern portion of same building, 3950 N. Brown Avenue, was initiated by the Historic Preservation Commission on November 13, 2003 and has been assigned case #21-ZN-2003)

### REGULAR AGENDA ITEMS

8. Discussion/Action: Draft 2004 Work Program from January 24, 2004 Retreat
9. Committee Reports/Meeting Schedules/Discussion:
  - Historic Register Committee – Commissioners Gonzales and Wimmer
  - Education Outreach Committee – Commissioner Hartz
10. Report/Discussion: HPO/Staff Report and Announcements
11. Commissioner Comments and Announcements /Public Comments\*
12. Future Meetings and Agenda Items\*
13. Adjournment

\*The Commission cannot discuss or vote on items not on the agenda, including items brought up as Commission or public comments. If action by a Commission is needed, the item should be placed on the next meeting's agenda to be consistent with the Arizona Open Meetings Law.



Persons with a disability may request a reasonable accommodation, such as a sign language interpreter, by contacting the City Clerk's Office at 312-2412. Requests should be made as early as possible to allow time to arrange accommodations.

**MINUTES  
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION  
7447 E. INDIAN SCHOOL ROAD  
FIRST FLOOR COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT CONFERENCE ROOM  
FEBRUARY 12, 2004  
5:00 P.M.**

**CALL TO ORDER**

The meeting was called to order at 5:00 P.M.

**ATTENDANCE**

Present: Ed Wimmer, Chair  
B.J. Gonzales, Vice Chair  
Nancy Dallett  
George Hartz  
Kathy Howard  
Cathy Johnson  
Paul Winslow

Staff: Don Meserve  
Debbie Abele, HPO

Visitors: Tom Krawczyk, Carroll Huntress, Kathy Duley, Nick Rayder

**ROLL CALL**

A formal roll call confirmed all Commission members present as stated above.

**MINUTES**

Commissioner Johnson requested a correction to the January 8, 2004 minute. On page 2, under Property Designation, second paragraph, the word register should be capitalized.

Commissioner Hartz made a motion to approve the minutes of the January 8, 2004 meeting as amended. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Gonzales and passed unanimously, 7-0.

115

**OVERVIEW OF DOWNTOWN SURVEY PROCESS AND FINDINGS**

Ms. Abele provided an overview on the survey process used for the Downtown Survey. She reviewed the various architectural styles present in the downtown area that were identified by Don Ryden architect.

Ms. Able reviewed the list of properties for possible consideration for the Scottsdale Historic Register as approved unanimously by the Historic Preservation Commission, October 11, 2001. She noted that initially six downtown properties were selected for consideration for HP designation. She summarized what happened with the first six proposed designations.



Ms. Abele stated that after doing research on the Westernaire building at the southwest corner of Brown Avenue and 1<sup>st</sup> Avenue, staff found that there are two owners for two properties related to the building. Staff has now contacted both owners and they are supportive of the initiation.

Chair Wimmer inquired for the record what buildings the staff is recommending the Commission focus on. Ms. Abele replied the Pink Pony, Sugar Bowl, Westernaire, Woolworths/Scottsdale Savings Bank, and Pima Plaza. Ms. Abele stated that since the composition of the Commission has changed since October 2001 they should take another look at the list.

Ms. Abele reported there was some controversy regarding the Valley Bank building designation at the southeast corner of Scottsdale and Indian School Roads. It was debated in the public hearings whether the Western theme building was significant. The owner decided to oppose the designation after the hearing process started and the Planning Commission voted against the HP overlay when the owner opposed the HP zoning. Ms. Abele would say absolutely that the Valley Bank building meets more than one criteria for being historically significant. She further reported, with regard to the Valley Bank building, they now have reason to not move forward with designation because staff has had meetings with the owners'. They have assured the City there are no plans to do anything with the site and that they have a long-term lessee in the building.

Commissioner Gonzales stated the Commission is not here to pass only things that they thought are going to be winners. They are here by public demand to assess these individual buildings regarding whether they think they have historic significance. He further stated he did not want the Commission to shy away from doing things that are not popular because they are ultimately judged by their actions.

Commissioner Winslow stated that he agreed with Commissioner Gonzales but as a practical matter, he would hate to see unnecessary conflict just because they believe they are right when they could achieve the same goal in a practical way.

Mr. Meserve stated as a footnote, that at a recent presentation to the Planning Commission in January 2004 the Commission reiterated that they felt it was important to have property owner support for HP overlay zoning.

Chair Wimmer suggested the Commission have a future discussion regarding achieving a middle ground whereby they have a property owner that is adverse to the designation but where the Commission goes on record that they believe the building is worthy of recognition on the Register.

## **REVIEW OF HP ORDINANCE DESIGNATION CRITERIA**

Ms. Abele reviewed the HP Ordinance designation criteria and distributed the relevant ordinance text. She requested the maker of a motion to place a property on the Scottsdale Historic Register specify the criteria used in making the decision so that it becomes a part of the record. Two properties were later on the agenda for consideration of such motions.

## **DRAFT 2004 WORK PROGRAM FROM JANUARY 24, 2004 RETREAT**

Ms. Abele requested the Commission review the draft 2004 Work Program and indicate anything that staff omitted or should be amended. Ms. Abele stated the third bullet under Designation should be changed to read: Initiate the survey and study of 1950s Multi-Family housing complexes. Ms. Abele reported the Commissioner has evaluated progress on each year's work program about mid-year.

Commissioner Dallett stated they discussed creating a subcommittee for multi-family housing at the retreat. Chair Wimmer stated the way that discussion was left was that the Historic Register Committee would take the lead in deciding whether they needed additional people to complete their survey activities.

Commissioner Winslow moved to approve the 2004 Work Program as modified. Second by Commissioner Dallett and passed unanimously, 7-0.

## **PUBLIC COMMENT**

Commissioner Gonzales suggested moving to public comment on the agenda since property owners were advised that the public hearing would start around 6:00 P.M.. Chair Wimmer asked for public comment.

Mr. Nick Rayder stated that the City had an architectural consultant complete a Building Assessment Condition Report in 2002 for the OLP Mission Church on Brown Avenue. Mr. Rayder said the report helped propel the parishioners and church office into doing a lot of work and starting very significant activities for the historic church property. He further stated the report by Don Ryden architect is an incredible piece of work that led to them hiring an architect. At the last church meeting the architect presented an overview of what would happen. Mr. Rayden brought a copy of a newspaper article on the old stained glass windows.

Mr. Rayden further reported they have had two open houses and a service in the church, noting they were exciting and very emotional because people were hugging each other and crying, and some of the comments were heart wrenching. He noted that underscores why they are in the business of preserving historic buildings because there is so much spirit they are not just structures there is a lot of soul. He reported they have recovered old pictures of activities that occurred in the Mission Church that are now on the walls of the church. He further reported that during the recent Parada del Sol, church members had a table in front of the historic church and passed out brochures for donations for rehabilitating the building. He thanked the City for the wonderful bench out in front containing a picture of the church. Mr. Meserve commented Preservation could not take responsibility for the bench since their installation was part of the broader City effort to place new benches in the downtown area.

Commissioner Gonzales stated it was his understanding that religious services would be held again in the building. Mr. Rayder replied there would not be regular services but there would be prayer services held. He noted the historic Mission Church would be operated more like a tourist attraction for the downtown.

Commissioner Gonzales asked if they were able to locate any of the original pews. Mr. Rayder reported they have six or eight original pews.

Commissioner Winslow inquired if it would be possible for them to take his quote about how helpful this report was and assign his name. Mr. Rayder replied that would be okay.

Chair Wimmer inquired about the schedule for the planned rehabilitation and addition. Mr. Rayder replied that would be a function of the donations from the capital campaign but he would guess two years.

Commissioner Dallett stated the Arizona Jewish Historical Society is undergoing a similar process with a historic place of worship and there would be a lot of information they could share and learn from one another.

Commissioner Gonzales stated that he felt it was important to have follow-up from people like Mr. Rayden on what is happening to buildings placed on the Register.

## **PUBLIC HEARING**

**20-ZN-2003/6-HP-2003, Sugar Bowl Historic Property Overlay Zoning:** request by the City of Scottsdale, applicant, Jaclyn H. Krawczyk, Margery H. Morton, Frederick R. Huntress, and Northern Trust Bank, N.A., Trustee, owners to rezone from Central Business District (C-2) to Central Business, Historic Property (C-2 HP)

on .13± acre parcel located at 3935 and 4005 N. Scottsdale Road. The Commission initiated this case November 13, 2003 so this case is a City-initiated rezoning.

Ms. Abele, Historic Preservation Officer (HPO) presented this case as per the staff report and designation report. The HPO recommends approval to list the property on the Scottsdale Historic Register.

Commissioner Johnson stated she wanted to confirm that what they are calling the Sugar Bowl is the entire building contains two businesses. Ms. Abele replied in the affirmative and they could make that a condition of the motion. Mr. Meserve noted that just the building is proposed for designation and not the adjacent parking lot property to the east.

Chair Wimmer opened public testimony.

Tom Krawczyk remarked they are pleased and excited to be considered for historical designation.

Carroll Huntress stated he is the owner of the Sugar Bowl restaurant and they are in favor of the building being designated for historic preservation.

Chair Wimmer closed public testimony.

Commissioner Gonzales moved to forward a recommendation to the Planning Commission and City council to apply HP overlay zoning (C-2HP) to the Sugar Bowl and to list the property on the Scottsdale Historic Register (20-ZN-2003/6-HP-2003). Seconded by Commissioner Howard.

Commissioner Dallett proposed an amendment to the motion to include the following reasons for designation:

- 1) The building is associated with an important pattern of development, which conveys the reuse of the Western Motor Service and the Cancellation Shoe Center.
- 2) The Sugar Bowl is associated with Jack Huntress, a significant person from Scottsdale's past.
- 3) The building is a community institution with a high degree of integrity.

The maker of the motion and second agreed to Commissioner Dallett's amendment. The motion passed unanimously, 7-0.

**19-ZN-2003/5-HP-2003, Pink Pony Restaurant Historic Property Overlay Zoning:** request by City of Scottsdale, applicant, Charles W. Briley Revocable Trust (Gwen Briley), owner, to rezone from Central Business District (C-2) to Central Business, Historic Property (C-2 HP) on an .2± acre parcel located at 3831 N. Scottsdale Road. The Commission initiated this case November 13, 2003 so this case is a City-initiated rezoning.

Ms. Abele, Historic Preservation Officer (HPO) presented this case as per the staff report and designation report. The HPO recommends approval to list the property on the Scottsdale Historic Register.

Chair Wimmer inquired if the doors and entire façade were included. Ms. Abele replied in the affirmative.

Commissioner Johnson stated she walked around the building today and it would appear the new building across Scottsdale Road seems to play off of the Pink Pony as far as architectural design.

Commissioner Gonzales stated the façade is not the original façade. Ms. Abele replied the alteration is significant in its own right in terms of why it was done.

Chair Wimmer opened public testimony, and noted for the record that no public comment was received.

Commissioner Hartz moved to forward a recommendation to the Planning Commission and City Council to apply HP overlay zoning (C-2HP) to the Pink Pony and to list the property on the Scottsdale Historic Register (19-ZN-2003/5-HP-2003) recognizing the following:

- 1) The building is historically significant for its association with Scottsdale's Post World War II community planning and development patterns for its association with the town's social history; and
- 2) Its association with Charlie Briley, a very important figure in the history of Scottsdale for his role in bringing the Cactus League to Scottsdale, which is a vital part of Scottsdale's image over the past 50 years; and
- 3) It should be noted that the remodeling is considered historically significant.

Second by Commissioner Johnson and passed by a vote of six (6) to one (1) with Commissioner Gonzales dissenting.

**Initiation of HP-Historic Property Zoning for the Weirich-Westernaire Shops:** Consider the Historic Preservation Commission initiating an HP overlay zoning case for the Westernaire Shops at 7239 E. 1<sup>st</sup> Avenue, owned by Mabel Weirich, and to place the property on the Scottsdale Historic Register.

Ms. Abele reported when they originally considered to plan initiation for this building, staff was not aware there were two property owners and were surprised to find out the building was on two separate lots. They would like to expand the boundaries for the case to include both lots. She reported the building was first called the Weirich Building and then there was a contest held to name the building and the name Westernaire Shops was the winning name. Ms. Abele has met with Ms. Weirich and she supports the proposed designation.

Commissioner Winslow stated that he had some problems with this building being brought forward individually. He further stated that he would be more comfortable if the designation was part of a district because he did not find the building to have unique architectural character. The building was significant because it was the first multi-tenant building and it is an institution within the community. He suggested they include the other adjacent buildings on 1<sup>st</sup> Avenue. Ms. Abele replied there were not enough buildings to meet the district criteria but it could be designated a significant streetscape that reflects the buildings of that period.

Chair Wimmer inquired if there was anything significant regarding the way the parking is setup if the streetscape had historical significance. Ms. Abele noted they would draw the boundaries to include the two one-way streets on this block called Pima Plaza in the 1950s.

Commissioner Hartz expressed his concern regarding the fact that tying the Westernaire Shops with Pima Plaza could delay it indefinitely.

The Commission directed staff to revise the boundaries for the historic property overlay zoning, and bring back another HP boundary map for their consideration. There were no public comments on this case.

## **COMMITTEE REPORTS**

### **Historic Register Committee**

Chair Wimmer stated the Historic Register Committee is continuing to do work on the neighborhoods. Ms. Abele replied staff is preparing some analysis on the initial tour on Saturday, February 24, 2004.

### **Education Outreach Committee**

Commissioner Hartz reported the Education Outreach Committee met on January 21st, and reviewed the work that has been accomplished in 2003 and set Committee priorities for 2004. He further reported that he and Don Prior met on the February 10th, and discussed their priorities.

## **HPO STAFF REPORT AND ANNOUNCEMENTS**

Ms. Abele stated she was thrilled to learn the OLPH Building Condition Assessment Report was helpful. Chair Wimmer suggested the Education Committee link up with the gentleman from OLPH because there is some good copy there.

Ms. Able updated the Commission on her meeting with the building committee for the First Baptist Church. The City received a letter stating that the committee was not interested in pursuing an HP overlay zoning or having the building listed on the Register at this time.

Mr. Meserve stated the Commission would be receiving future reports regarding archeological resources and the Desert Mountain master planned development. The archaeology report submitted for one of the last and most northern phases of the Desert Mountain development recorded several sites that could be impacted by future development. A Mitigation Plan and data recovery for the recorded sites is anticipated.

## **FUTURE MEETINGS AND AGENDA ITEMS**

Ms. Able stated she had the benefit of a student last semester who did an independent study on the post war school buildings in Scottsdale. She inquired if the Commission would like a presentation on that study. The Commission would like a future presentation on the study findings.

## **COMMISSION ITEMS**

Chair Wimmer reminded the Commission that a meeting of the East Valley Coalition would be held on February 24th, at Monti's in Tempe. He stated that he spoke with the Chair of the East Valley Coalition and advised him that the consensus of the Commission at the retreat was they were interested in being part of the coalition to gain information but did not feel it would be appropriate to get involved in political efforts. He also shared that they were not interested in expanding the coalition and having it become Valleywide.

Commissioner Dallett inquired if it was important for the commissioners' to attend the March 10, 2004 Planning Commission public hearing. Ms. Abele replied it was not necessary because they would be providing them with a packet full of information including the recommendations from this Commission.

Meeting adjourned at 7:10 p.m.

Submitted by:

For the Record Court Reporters  
21404min

## AGENDA

### THE SCOTTSDALE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

**DAY & DATE:** Thursday, April 8, 2004

**TIME:** 5:00 p.m.

**LOCATION:** 1st Floor Community Development Conference Room,  
One Civic Center, 7447 E. Indian School Road, Scottsdale, AZ

1. Introductions and Roll Call
2. Minutes: March 11, 2003 Minutes

### PUBLIC HEARING/ACTION ITEMS

3. **1-HP-2004 Cattle Track Complex Certificate of Appropriateness (Cattle Track Complex Historic Property)** - request by Janie Ellis, owner/applicant to approve relocating two residential structures, totaling 2,530 square feet area, to two pad sites identified on the approved site plan for the historic property located at 6105 N. Cattle Track Road, zoned Special Campus, Historic Property (SR HP). The Commission will use the design guidelines from the approved Historic Preservation Plan and the site plan approved by City Council in case 35-ZN-1995#4 for this property to determine whether the requested Certificate of Appropriateness should be approved. **Staff contact person is Don Meserve, 480-312-2523.**
4. **20-ZN-2003/6-HP-2003, Sugar Bowl Historic Property Overlay:** request by City of Scottsdale, applicant, Jaclyn H. Krawczyk, Margery H. Morton, Frederick R. Huntress, and Northern Trust Bank, N.A, Trustee, owners to rezone from Central Business District Downtown Overlay (C-2 DO) to Central Business, Downtown Overlay, Historic Property (C-2 DO HP) on .13± acre parcel located at 3935 and 4005 N. Scottsdale Road. **Staff/Applicant contact person is Don Meserve, 480-312-2523.** Comments: This request would add Historic Property (HP) overlay zoning to the Sugar Bowl property containing two businesses (Sugar Bowl and AZ Accents) in downtown Scottsdale, and place the building on the Scottsdale Historic Register. No changes in use or the underlying zoning are proposed.
- ✓ 5. **19-ZN-2003/5-HP-2003, Pink Pony Restaurant Historic Property Overlay Zoning:** request by City of Scottsdale, applicant, Charles W. Briley Revocable Trust (Gwen Briley), owner, to rezone from Central Business District Downtown Overlay (C-2 DO) to Central Business, Downtown Overlay, Historic Property (C-2 DO HP) on an .2± acre parcel located at 3831 N. Scottsdale Road. **Staff/Applicant contact person is Don Meserve, 480-312-2523.** Comments: This request would add Historic Property (HP) overlay zoning to the Pink Pony Restaurant property in downtown Scottsdale, and place the building on the Scottsdale Historic Register. No changes in use or the underlying zoning are proposed.

### WORK SESSION ITEM

6. **Hotel Valley Ho Historic Property** – review background, prior approvals, and current amended plans with the owner and architects for this project in preparation for a future hearing on a Certificate of Appropriateness for the latest site plan, elevations and other elements of the project

### REGULAR AGENDA ITEMS

7. Discussion: Potential Downtown Collections/Districts on Main Street and 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue
  - Comments on 3/25 tour and discussion of integrity considerations and boundaries
8. Committee Reports/Meeting Schedules/Discussion:
  - Historic Register Committee – Commissioner Howard

- Education Outreach Committee – Commissioner Hart.

9. Report/Discussion: HPO/Staff Report and Announcements

10. Commissioner Comments and Announcements /Public Comments\*

11. Future Meetings and Agenda Items\*

12. Adjournment

\*The Commission cannot discuss or vote on items not on the agenda, including items brought up as Commission or public comments. If action by a Commission is needed, the item should be placed on the next meeting's agenda to be consistent with the Arizona Open Meetings Law.



Persons with a disability may request a reasonable accommodation, such as a sign language interpreter, by contacting the City Clerk's Office at 312-2412. Requests should be made as early as possible to allow time to arrange accommodations.

V:4804hpc