

Exterior Building Color & Material Samples

Color Drawdowns

Archaeological Resources

Airport Vicinity Development Checklist

Parking Study

Trip Generation Comparison

Parking Master Plan

SUMMARY OF TRANSPORTATION POLICIES AND CONCERNS RELATED TO VILLA MONTEREY

Prepared by Don Meserve, AICP, Historic Preservation Officer, May 2011

This analysis includes comments on adopted transportation policies and a discussion of transportation concerns related to Villa Monterey and specifically to Chaparral Road including; 1) 2008 Transportation Master Plan Streets Element, 2) May 2007 City Council Consideration of alternatives to widening Chaparral Road, 3) Southern Scottsdale Character Area Plan, and 4) Planning Commission comments and recommendation from April 27, 2011 public hearing. Several documents were reviewed in the preparation of this summary including adopted or approved policies and plans, marked agendas and minutes from public hearings, and staff reports. The attachment includes three aerials of Chaparral Road between Miller Road and 78th Street.

2008 Transportation Master Plan

The goals and policies of the adopted Transportation Master Plan prescribe a standard for planning road improvements that aims to balance citywide mobility needs with the impact of the transportation system on neighborhoods and existing land uses. Two goals related to this need for balance are in the Streets Element 2.0 Goals on page 52 which states: "Maintain and improve citywide traffic circulation by widening roadways where appropriate and in concert with citywide goals of neighborhood protection..." and "Protect neighborhoods from negative impacts of traffic." In addition, the 3.1 Context-sensitive Design text on page 53 states: "Design, operate, and maintain the transportation network to improve travel conditions for bicyclists, pedestrians, transit, vehicles, equestrians, and freight, in a manner consistent with and supportive of the General Plan and Transportation Master Plan goals, and adapted to the localized context (emphasis added) within the different areas of the City..." Page 70, 6.5 Roadway Modification Guidelines regarding addressing traffic congestion includes the same philosophy of context-sensitive design: "In order to address congestion issues, communities are often faced with the need to add additional travel lane capacity to the transportation network. This need must also be weighed against neighborhood impacts and community character or context issues."

Based upon this approach to transportation planning, if City Council decides to recognize and designate a neighborhood as historically significant to the community, then this historic designation would be considered in any future analysis that compares mobility goals and objectives to the localized neighborhood context and adopted neighborhood protection policies. Historic preservation does not bind future decision making on transportation needs but a designated historic district becomes an important consideration for the "context-sensitive design" prescribed in the Transportation Master Plan. The goals and policies in the adopted plan support the consideration of neighborhood impacts and community character in transportation planning; mobility needs must be weighed relative to neighborhood impacts, not in a vacuum.

The Streets Element also includes street classifications and cross sections for minor collector and higher classification streets. Figure 4-5: Recommended Street Functional Classification shows both Miller Road and Chaparral Road adjacent to and through the Villa Monterey Units 1-7 townhouse development as Minor Collector – Suburban. The cross sections show a standard right-of-way for a Minor Collector – Suburban as 70 feet. The existing two lanes for traffic and bike lanes on both roads would be consistent with Minor Collector standards. The existing rights-of way for both Miller and Chaparral Roads of 80 feet in Villa Monterey exceed the standard. However the cross section also shows sidewalks with a width of 6 to 8 feet separated from the curb. The existing sidewalk widths on Miller and Chaparral Roads of less than 6 feet width are substandard. A HAWK pedestrian crossing was installed on Chaparral Road to the east of Villa Monterey to provide enhanced pedestrian and bicycle access in response to resident's concerns about traffic. There have been discussions on

the potential need to address traffic issues in the area. The Hayden/Chaparral Roads intersection improvements to the east of Villa Monterey neighborhood are included in the 5-year Capital Improvement Program.

In addition to the adopted 2008 Transportation Master Plan, the Transportation Commission approved the 'Neighborhood Traffic Management Program' in 2007 with revisions to the plan recently approved by the Commission in 2010. The goals of the program are included in the Policy Element of the Transportation Master Plan under 8.0, Neighborhood Traffic Management. The program includes qualifying criteria for traffic calming projects. The Transportation Department and the Transportation Commission can work with neighborhoods on their traffic concerns through this program. Since this program was approved, the Transportation Department has been working with neighborhoods throughout the city to address traffic concerns on a case-by-case basis.

May 2007 City Council Consideration of alternatives to widening Chaparral Road and Impacts of alternatives

On March 20, 2007, City Council received a petition from about 1300 residents to remove the concept of widening Chaparral Road from consideration in the Transportation Master Plan. On April 10, 2007, Council approved a motion to have staff prepare a presentation on alternatives to widening Chaparral Road and to conduct a public hearing by the end of May 2007. The item was discussed at a public hearing on May 29, 2007.

The Transportation staff report and presentation to City Council included the results from the 'May 2007 Chaparral Road, Miller Road to Hayden Road Roadway Evaluation'. Two main alternatives to widening Chaparral Road were presented to Council: 1) Maintain existing/do not reduce traffic volumes, and 2) Restrict traffic volumes to 1992-1996 levels. The city staff's traffic analysis included the impacts of widening Chaparral Road from Miller Road to 78th Street to four travel lanes. The Summary Assessment on page 12 of the staff report contained the following statement: "The option of widening Chaparral Road could be eliminated without major transportation system impacts or impacts on Downtown growth and revitalization; however, there would be moderate increases in traffic on adjacent and parallel roads if the existing configuration is retained." The staff report noted that if Council pursued the second alternative of redesigning the roadway segment to reduce the traffic on Chaparral Road, larger increases in traffic on adjacent or parallel streets would result from traffic restrictions. City Council agreed with the Transportation staff report and presentation that it could eliminate the option of widening Chaparral Road. They did not vote on alternative 1) or 2) in their motion.

At the conclusion of the hearing, City Council voted 6-1 in favor of an amended motion to remove the option of condemning houses and widening Chaparral Road from consideration and to include the option of not increasing traffic capacity on Chaparral Road. This Council decision does not pose any problems for the proposed designation of Villa Monterey as a historic district. The present classification of Chaparral Road in the Transportation Master Plan as a Minor Collector is consistent with this May 29, 2007 City Council vote; the concept of widening the roadway to increase capacity was removed from consideration in the plan. The existing street design also conforms to the May 2007 City Council vote. The Transportation Commission and/or City Council could reconsider the classification of Chaparral Road in the future.

Southern Scottsdale Character Area Plan

Villa Monterey Units 1-7 is within the Southern Scottsdale Character Area Plan boundary. The goals and policies in this adopted October 2010 plan would be used for any future transportation planning using a context-sensitive design approach and adopted policies, but the plan says little about transportation. Many of the goals and policies in this plan are aimed at protecting, maintaining and/or revitalizing neighborhoods. Goal NR 1 is to "Enhance current residential neighborhoods within southern Scottsdale." Included in the policies to implement

this goal is Policy NR 1.5 to continue “the designation of residential and neighborhood historic properties and districts, which protect and enhance property values through appropriate restoration, preservation, and promotion of significant historic resources.” Goal NR 3 in the Neighborhood Revitalization section is to: “Strengthen neighborhood identity, unity, and health within Southern Scottsdale.” The goals in the Southern Scottsdale Character Area Plan support the designation of significant historic neighborhoods as historic districts.

Planning Commission recommendation from April 27, 2011 public hearing

Members of the Planning Commission had questions for historic preservation staff and the city attorney present, Joe Padilla, on the potential impacts of the designation of a Villa Monterey Units 1-7 historic district on transportation planning. They voiced some concerns about a historic district binding or restricting future transportation planning. The Commission included in their unanimous motion to City Council in support of the district “that the Historic Preservation designation not restrict the City of Scottsdale from future transportation and traffic planning in the area.” This analysis will describe the staff responses to their concerns. Residents or interested citizens also asked questions about Chaparral Road in neighborhood meetings and received similar responses from staff as those provided at the Planning Commission hearing.

Regarding questions or concerns about whether City Council can decide to widen Chaparral Road from Miller Road to 78th Street through Villa Monterey, the answer is yes the city could change the classification of the street and widen it to four lanes. Council could also remove the HP zoning from one side of Chaparral Road in the future in order to acquire the homes for road widening. Council has the prerogative to change previous policies and revisit the Transportation Master Plan.

Would the designation of a historic district prevent any future widening of Chaparral Road? No. Staff advised the Planning Commission that residents have been told in neighborhood meetings that if the historic district is approved, there is no guarantee that City Council or the Transportation Commission would not decide to reconsider the reclassification of Chaparral Road or the widening of the road in the future. Existing policies were described to residents but they were also told that policies can be changed by a vote of City Council.

Do residents want the impacts of street improvements on their neighborhood considered in transportation planning? Yes, the fact that a neighborhood is designated a historic district and is a stable well-maintained residential land use should be considered when evaluating the impacts of traffic improvements. Since the Transportation Master Plan contains policies for ‘context-sensitive design’ and adapting the transportation system to the ‘localized context’, existing residential neighborhoods and other land uses should be part of weighing local impacts versus citywide mobility needs.

Balancing local or neighborhood concerns with citywide traffic concerns does not make HP zoning or existing land uses ‘binding’ on transportation planning, to use the term from Planning Commissioners. The City Attorney’s Office can address Council questions on street improvements in their public hearing, but Joe Padilla’s response to the Planning Commissioner’s questions was that an HP district would not prohibit transportation planning, that Council can decide what it wants to do to improve and manage a public right-of-way to promote public safety and move traffic efficiently, and Council could decide to remove the HP overlay zoning. The city could also purchase property through eminent domain for a public purpose like road widening.

Attachment: Existing Rights-of-way on Chaparral Roads

EXISTING RIGHTS-OF-WAY ON CHAPARRAL ROAD, 5/2011



Figure 1. Chaparral Road at Miller Road Intersection

Proposed HP: Villa Monterey is on the northeast and southeast corners of this intersection

Recommended Street Functional Classification:

East of Miller = Minor Collector – Suburban

West of Miller = Major Collector – Suburban

Existing Cross Sections for Street Classifications/Typical Cross Sections:

Minor Collector Suburban Character = 70' ROW; Existing = 80' ROW (Exceeds standard)

Major Collector Suburban Character = 100' ROW; Existing = 80' ROW (Substandard)



Figure 2. Chaparral Road at 77th Street Intersection

Proposed HP: Villa Monterey is on both the north and south sides of Chaparral Road

Recommended Street Functional Classification:

East of Miller to 78th = Minor Collector – Suburban

Existing Cross Sections for Street Classifications/Typical Cross Sections:

Minor Collector Suburban Character = 70' ROW; Existing = 80' ROW (Exceeds standard)



Figure 3. Chaparral Road at 78th Street Intersection

Proposed HP: Villa Monterey is on the northwest and southwest corners of this intersection

Recommended Street Functional Classification:

West of 78th = Minor Collector – Suburban

East of 78th = Major Collector – Suburban

Existing Cross Sections for Street Classifications/Typical Cross Sections:

Minor Collector Suburban Character = 70' ROW; Existing = 80' ROW (Exceeds standard)

Major Collector Suburban Character = 100' ROW; Existing = 110' (Exceeds standard)